

381
39

E 56

(Not to be sent up to Simla.)
**PUNJAB CIVIL SECRETARIAT
LIBRARY COPY.**
(To be returned to the Library when done with.)

REPORT

ON THE WORKING OF THE

PUNJAB AND NORTH-WEST FRONTIER PROVINCE JOINT PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

FOR THE YEAR

E-56

1937-38.

13033



Lahore :

Printed by the Superintendent, Government Printing, Punjab.
1938.

Price : Re. 1-4-0 or 1s. 11d.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

i-iv

iii-iv

v-xii

xvi-xvii

xxi-xxii

xxv-xxvi

xxviii-xxix

No. 7789-G.-38/36761.

FROM

A. V. ASKWITH, ESQUIRE, I.C.S.,

Home Secretary to Government, Punjab,

TO

THE CHAIRMAN, PUNJAB AND NORTH-
WEST FRONTIER PROVINCE JOINT
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION,
LAHORE.

Dated Lahore, the 4th November, 1938.

Home.

Gazette.

Subject :—REPORT ON THE WORKING OF THE PUNJAB AND
NORTH-WEST FRONTIER PROVINCE JOINT
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION FOR THE YEAR
1937-38.

SIR,

I AM directed to acknowledge the receipt of the report on the working of the Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Joint Public Service Commission for the year 1937-38 and to convey the thanks of Government to the members of the Commission for the care which they have shown in the discharge of their duties during the year.

2. The various suggestions made in the report are receiving the attention of Government.

I have the honour to be,

SIR,

Your most obedient servant,

A. V. ASKWITH,

Home Secretary to Government, Punjab.

NO. 1000-3438161

A. V. ASKIN, JR.

Home Secretary's Office, Washington, D.C.

THE ATTORNEY GENERAL
WASHINGTON, D.C.

Dear Sir:

I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt of your letter of the 10th instant regarding the matter mentioned therein.

The Bureau is currently reviewing the information submitted to it and will advise you of the results of its investigation as soon as possible.

Very truly yours,
A. V. ASKIN, JR.

A. V. ASKIN, JR.
Home Secretary's Office, Washington, D.C.

Report on the working of the Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Joint Public Service Commission for the year 1937-38.

1. The Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Joint Public Service Commission was constituted under section 264 (2) (a) of the Government of India Act, 1935, by an agreement entered into between the Governors of the Punjab and the North-West Frontier Province on the 24th April, 1937. According to the terms of this agreement, the Commission is to consist of six members, of whom four, including the Chairman, are to be appointed by the Governor of the Punjab and two by the Governor of the North-West Frontier Province. The term of appointment of members is five years. The headquarters of the Commission are at Lahore.

The Governor of the Punjab appointed Mr. J. Slattery, O.B.E., a retired Deputy Inspector-General of Police Punjab, to be Chairman of the Commission, and

- (i) K. B. Nawab Mohammad Hayat Qureshi, C.I.E.
- (ii) Rao Bahadur Capt. Ch. Lal Chand, O.B.E.,
- (iii) Sardar Bahadur Sardar Prabh Singh, B. A., M.I.E. (retired Superintending Engineer, Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch, Punjab),

to be Members. The Governor of the North-West Frontier Province appointed—

- (i) Professor W. R. Jones, B.Sc. (Hons.), and
- (ii) Khan Bahadur Sardar Moghal Baz Khan, O.B.E. I.O.M., I.D.S.M.,

to be Members of the Commission.

Mr. B. F. H. B. Tyabji, I.C.S., was appointed Secretary to the Commission. The Chairman, Members and Secretary of the Commission assumed charge of their duties on the 1st May, 1937.

2. The functions of the Commission are laid down in section 266 of the Government of India Act, 1935, read with the Limitation of Functions regulations made thereunder by the Governors of the Punjab

and the North-West Frontier Province separately. They are of an advisory nature, but both Governments have adopted the convention that the advice of the Commission shall, save in exceptional circumstances, be accepted.

3. With the permission of the Punjab Government and of the Chairman, of the Federal Public Service Commission, the Chairman, with Sardar Bahadur Prabh Singh, and the Secretary and the office Superintendent visited Simla in the last week of May, 1937, to study the working of the Federal Public Service Commission.

Visit of the Commission to Simla.
4. The Commission adopted, with some modifications, the standard requisition form prescribed by the Federal Public Service Commission for use by Departments of Government when asking the Commission to recommend candidates for posts to be filled by direct recruitment. This form, when filled by Departments, furnishes complete information concerning the post to be filled and the qualifications required of candidates; and in accordance therewith the Commission advertise the post. The minimum qualifications laid down are not departed from except after a reference to the Department concerned.

Standard requisition form.
5. The Commission similarly adopted a standard detailed application form, supplied free to candidates, for posts advertised by the Commission.

Standard Application form.
6. The Commission prescribed a fee of Rs. 5 to be paid by candidates with their application forms and no application is entertained unless accompanied by a money order or a treasury receipt for this amount. This fee is credited to the revenues of the Punjab Government. Payment, however, is not insisted on in the case of candidates applying from places outside India. When once paid, the fee is not refunded to candidates in any circumstances. The examination fee in the case of the Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) is as hitherto, Rs. 50 and in the case of the Punjab Civil Service (Judicial Branch) Rs. 30.

Application fee.
7. For each post to be filled by direct recruitment the Commission prepare, for the information of candidates, a statement giving full details of the qualifications required, age limits, pay, preference to a particular community, etc., and a copy of this statement is forwarded to each candidate along with the application form.

Statement of information for candidates.

8. The Commission's advertisements inviting applications for posts are generally published in the following newspapers :—

Advertisements
of the Commis-
sion.

- (i) The *Civil and Military Gazette*, Lahore.
- (ii) The *Tribune*, Lahore.
- (iii) The *Eastern Times*, Lahore.
- (iv) The *Khyber Mail*, Peshawar.
- (v) The *Leader*, Allahabad.
- (vi) The *Statesman*, Delhi,
- (vii) The *Bombay Chronicle*, Bombay
- (viii) The *Hindu*, Madras.

} Occasionally.

They are also published in the weekly Gazettes of the Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Governments.

To ensure that candidates know when to look for the Commissions' advertisements, the Commission publish them only in the Friday issues of newspapers; and press *communiques* have drawn attention to this fact.

Copies of notices issued by the Commission calling for applications for various posts to be filled either by direct selection or by competitive examination are supplied regularly, for publicity purposes, to all Deputy Commissioners in the Punjab, the North-West Frontier Province and Delhi, Registrars of all recognised Universities in India, certain technical institutions and also to the Director of the Information Bureau, Punjab. Copies of advertisements together with the statement of 'Information for Candidates' are also sent to the High Commissioner for India in London whenever desirable, and even in cases which are not advertised in England. Copies of the standard application form prescribed by the Commission are also stocked in the High Commissioner's office. This is for the convenience of Indian candidates temporarily residing in England.

9. The Commission were requested to select candidates during the year for the posts given in Appendix 'A', and brief notes on recruitment will be found in Appendix 'B' and the statistical data in Appendix 'C'.

The Commission noticed that, contrary to the instructions, issued by the Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Governments to their Administrative Departments regarding the

procedure to be observed in their dealings with the Commission there was a tendency on the part of Administrative Departments to ask the Commission to recommend more than two names for each vacant post. In most cases the request for the recommendation of more than two names was withdrawn when attention was drawn to this fact.

The Commission were consulted on the suitability of certain candidates for the post of Subordinate Judge in the Punjab who had been accepted on the results of the previous examination and had not been appointed when the Commission was constituted.

10. It appeared to the Commission that, due to the heavy recruitment of Engineers by the Punjab Government in 1937, there was a dearth of Punjabi civil engineers, particularly among Sikhs and Muslims. As the Punjab Government are likely to recruit a further large number of engineers for new projects and as it has expressed a preference that the appointments should go to Punjabis, the Commission suggested for the consideration of Government the need of improved arrangements for training Punjabi students in Civil Engineering.

11. The Commission observed that the rules in force for the recruitment in recruitment of certain services make provision for the direct recruitment of candidates in England through the High Commissioner for India, London.

The Commission pointed out that under the Government of India Act, 1935, the responsibility for making recommendations for posts not excluded from their purview by the Limitation of Functions Regulations rested with them and that the High Commissioner for India in London had no authority in the matter of these appointments. The recruitment rules in question in so far as they were inconsistent with the said Act, were therefore under section 276, no longer valid. The Commission suggested accordingly that appointing authorities should forward their requirements to the Commission who would ask the High Commissioner to advertise the posts in England and arrange for interview of candidates there. The Commission would then compare the merits of the candidates recommended by the High Commissioner and those interviewed by them in India and make their final recommendations to Government. This procedure was approved by the North-West Frontier Province Government but is still under the consideration of the Punjab Government.

12. The Commission gave advice on 100 cases in which it was proposed to fill vacancies by promotion. Of these 82 were referred by the Punjab Government and 18 by the North-West Frontier Province Government. The Commission's recommendations were accepted in all cases.

Advice on promotion cases.

13. The Commission were consulted regarding the suitability of --

Appointment by transfer from one service or post to another.

- (i) Four officers of the Punjab Civil Service for appointment to the Punjab Jails Department as Superintendents of Jails.
- (ii) One officer of the North-West Frontier Province Civil Medical Service for appointment as Health Officer, Peshawar.

14. In June, 1937, the Punjab Government after consultation with the Commission placed the conduct of all Departmental examinations for the various services under the administrative control of the Governor of the Punjab, in the hands of the Commission. Accordingly the Commission conducted—

Departmental Examinations.

- (i) The Naib-Tahsildars' examination held in August, 1937; and
- (ii) the second half yearly departmental examination for Assistant Commissioners, Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsildars, Excise Sub-Inspectors, etc., held in November, 1937.

In the case of the Naib-Tahsildars' Examination the arrangements had already been made by the Director of Land Records, Punjab, and the Commission merely compiled the result and forwarded it to the authorities concerned. As regards the Departmental examination for Assistant Commissioners, Extra Assistant Commissioners, etc., the Commission made all the arrangements.

The experience gained in holding these examinations showed that the Departments were relieved of little, if any, trouble through the Commission's taking over the conduct of the examinations. The Departments would still have to provide the examiners and to do most of the clerical and other work involved. It seemed, therefore, to be unnecessary to associate the Commission with these examinations and the

Commission recommended accordingly that the work might be entrusted once more to the Departments. The Punjab Government accepted this request of the Commission.

The North-West Frontier Province Government had also contemplated entrusting the Commission with the conduct of their departmental examinations; but they too decided not to proceed with the matter.

15. The Commission conducted the Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) competitive examination and the Punjab Civil Service (Judicial Branch) qualifying examination during the year.

The Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) Examination was held between the 25th October and the 10th November, 1937. Four vacancies were offered for competition. The number of candidates who applied for admission to the examination was 183, of whom 163 actually sat for the examination and 123 qualified. The Commission were greatly impressed by the general high standard of the candidates. In the 1936 examination 116 candidates had sat and 49 had qualified.

Information regarding the number of candidates, community-wise, who appeared for the examination, etc., and a brief summary of the reports of the examiners will be found in Appendices "D" and "E", respectively.

This examination was held in the University Hall, Lahore, between the 21st and the 24th February, 1938. The nomination rolls of candidates for the examination were submitted by District and Sessions Judges and Heads of Departments to the Commission, instead of to the High Court as in previous years. Four hundred and forty-four candidates applied for admission to the examination, of whom 17 were found ineligible by the Commission. Two hundred and ninety-nine candidates sent intimation of their intention to appear, and 238 candidates actually appeared for the examination. The result had not been announced by the close of the year under report.

A departure from past practice in connection with this examination was that the Commission, after consultation with the Punjab Government, interviewed the candidates with a view to determining their general suitability for appointment to the service. The provisions of sub-section (2) of section 255 of the Government of India Act, 1935, seemed to the Commission to

make this necessary. The interviews were held between the 25th February and the 9th March, 1938. The Commission were not as impressed by the candidates as by those who had appeared for the Executive Branch examination.

(c) General. The Commission experienced difficulty in arranging for an examination hall for the examinations mentioned above. The University hall is not always available for the conduct of examinations held by the Commission.

It will be observed that of the candidates who applied for admission to the examinations held by the Commission, a large number eventually did not sit. This entails unnecessary work; and the Commission have, therefore, proposed that of the fee payable for an examination, a sum of Rs. 5 shall be paid by candidates when submitting their applications, the balance to be paid when admitted to the examination. The need to pay the initial instalment of the fee may assist the undecided candidates to make up their minds at an earlier stage.

The Commission have published, for public information, pamphlets containing the rules, syllabus, time-tables, question papers, tables of results and reviews by the Commission of the examinations conducted by them. These are available from the Superintendent, Government Printing, Punjab.

The Commission consider that the normal procedure for recruitment to the various Engineering services in the Punjab should be on the results of a competitive examination to be held by the Commission. Engineering candidates, it has been seen, qualify in many universities and institutions; and, without a competitive examination, it is difficult to assess the comparative merits of candidates. The commission have accordingly prepared the rules and syllabus for competitive examinations for the Punjab Service of Engineers, Classes I and II.

An inquiry was made by the Punjab Government whether the commission were prepared to take over the work connected with certain examinations which is done at present by various Departments of the Punjab Government on behalf of the Federal Public Service Commission. As the staff of the Commission at first lacked experience in such work, the Commission asked that they might be allowed to reply in the summer of 1938 when the staff had had the necessary experience and training.

16. The Commission gave advice on 10 disciplinary cases (all from the Punjab) against Government servants. Their recommendations were accepted by Government in nine cases. Orders on the tenth case were not received during the year. The Commission were

Disciplinary cases,
etc.

also consulted on five cases of appeals preferred by Government servants against punishments awarded four cases referred by the Punjab Government and one by the North-West Frontier Province Government. The advice tendered by the Commission was accepted in all cases.

The Commission observed that officers carrying out disciplinary inquiries did not in some cases strictly comply with the instructions contained in rule 55 of the Civil Services (Classification, Control and Appeal Rules and rule 6 of the Punjab Subordinate Services Punishment and Appeal Rules. They, therefore, addressed the Punjab and the North-West Frontier Province Governments inviting their attention to the mandatory character of the provisions of the rules in question and asked them to issue instructions to Heads of Departments that the rules should be carefully observed in future. The necessary instructions have been issued by both Governments.

17. In the early stages of their working, the Commission found that amendments to rules relating to various services, appointments to which can only be made on the advice of the Commission were issued by Departments without previous consultations with the Commission. The attention of the Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Governments was drawn to the fact that under the provisions of clauses (a) and (b) of sub-section (3) of section 266 of the Government of India Act, 1935, as they understood them, rules relating to recruitment for services within the purview of the Commission could only be issued after consultation with them.

The Commission were accordingly consulted on certain amendments proposed to be made by the Departments concerned to the following rules :—

- (i) Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) Rules.
- (ii) Punjab Service of Engineers (Irrigation Branch) Rules.
- (iii) Punjab Service of Engineer (Electricity Branch) Rules.
- (iv) Rules relating to the departmental examinations of accepted candidates for the post of Subordinate Judge in the Punjab.
- (v) North-West Frontier Province Civil Service Rules.

The Commission also on their own motion examined the recruitment rules of various services to bring them into con-

ormity with the changes effected by the Government of India Act, 1935 and made recommendations to the Punjab Government for the revision of rules for the following services :—

- (i) Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch).
- (ii) Punjab Service of Engineers (Electricity Branch).
- (iii) Punjab Service of Engineers (Irrigation Branch) Class II.
- (iv) Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II.

18. The Commission considered the existing syllabus prescribed for the Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) Examination and made proposals to Government for its revision.

Revision of the syllabus for the Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) examination.

19. The Commission were consulted by the Punjab Government on proposals to grant injury pensions in addition to ordinary pensions to two constables of the Punjab Police.

Injury Pensions.

20. Regulations 5 and 6 of these regulations being in the negative form are not easily intelligible. The Commission, therefore, prepared an exposition of them in the positive form and after obtaining the confirmation of the Punjab Government to its correctness communicated it for information to all appointing authorities. The regulations made by the Governor of the North-West Frontier Province being similar to those made by the Governor of the Punjab, a copy of the exposition in question was forwarded to the North-West Frontier Province Government for communication to appointing authorities in the North-West Frontier Province.

Working of the Limitation of Functions Regulations.

21. The Commission noticed from the notifications of appointments published in the *Punjab and North-West-Frontier Province Government Gazettes* from time to time that a large number of appointments were being made by appointing authorities without the consultation with the Commission which is required by the Government of India Act, 1935, read with the Limitation of Functions Regulations. Enquiries usually elicited the reply that the omission to consult the commission either had been inadvertent or that the persons appointed had actually been selected for appointment before the Commission came into existence. The Commission represented that the

Failure to consult the Commission in certain cases.

appointment after the 1st May, 1937, of persons selected as candidates before the formation of the Commission was irregular, as the said Act definitely required that the Commission should be consulted on all appointments not excluded from their jurisdiction and because the act of appointment was distinct from the act of selection as a candidate. The Punjab Government eventually amended the Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Joint Public Service Commission (Limitation of Functions) Regulations so as to exclude such appointments from the scope of the Commission and as regards other irregular appointments they issued instructions to appointing authorities concerned to examine the position in each case and to regularise it in correspondence with the Commission.

Five cases were observed during the year in which advertisements inviting applications for posts which could only be filled on the advice of the Commission were issued by appointing authorities themselves. The Commission promptly drew the attention of the Departments of Government concerned to the irregularity and asked them to entrust further proceedings in the matter to the Commission.

A list of such posts is given below —

- (i) Principal, Industrial Teachers' Training Class for Women, Lahore.
- (ii) Shift Engineers in the Punjab Public Works Department (Electricity Branch).
- (iii) Mechanical and Electrical Subordinate in the Punjab Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.
- (iv) Superintending Engineer, North-West Frontier Province, Hydro-Electric Department.....
In this case the advertisement had appeared in a newspaper in England.
- (v) A post in the North-West Frontier Province Educational Service (Women's Branch).

The Commission hope that with a fuller realization by Departments of their obligations to consult the Commission in the matter of appointments such irregularities will disappear.

22. Among the important miscellaneous references mention may be made of the following :—

Important
miscellaneous
references.

Mis-
refer-

The Commission were consulted on the draft rules made by the Punjab and the North-West Frontier Province

Governments on the procedure to be followed by Departments of Government in making references to the Commission.

2. The Punjab Government also consulted the Commission on the suggestion made by the Government of India for the introduction of a qualifying test for Government Service designed largely as a remedy for unemployment among the educated classes.
3. The draft rules made by the Punjab Government to regulate the Procedure to be observed by the Commission and the relations of the Commission with the Government and subordinate authorities were also referred to the Commission for an expression of their views.
4. On a reference from the Punjab Government the Commission advised that the 'A' Class diploma of the Maclagan Engineering College, Moghalpura, should be recognised as a qualification for Electrical and Mechanical posts in the Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch, Punjab, but not for other engineering posts.

23. The Commission decided to maintain a record of all candidates who appear before them for recruitment to services or posts.

Record of candidates.

24. At the outset the Commission took steps to prohibit canvassing on behalf of candidates for appointments and are glad to be able to say that very few attempts at canvassing were made. In such cases, prompt warnings were given to the persons concerned that such canvassing might seriously compromise the chances of the candidates concerned.

Canvassing.

25. Meetings of the Commission were ordinarily held twice a week for deliberation and disposal of cases.

Meetings of the Commission.

26. The office of the Commission was originally located in a hired building on 32, Davis Road, Lahore, but this building being unsuitable, the Commission moved to another bungalow on the same road.

Office accommodation.

27. The expenditure of the Commission for the year 1937-38 charged to the head 25-C (K)—General Administration—Secretariat and Headquarters Es-

Cost of the Commission.

establishment Public Service Commission was as follows:—

	Rs.
Pay of officers	1,33,700
Pay of Establishment	10,467
Travelling Allowance	802
Other Allowances and Honoraria	1,104
Contingencies	19,106
	<hr/>
Total	1,65,179
	<hr/>

This does not include the expenditure on stationery supplied from Central Stores, books and periodicals and the examinations conducted by the Commission which was debited to other heads of accounts. One sixth of the total expenditure of the Commission is under the terms of the agreement met by the North-West Frontier Province Government.

28. The Commission place on record their high appreciation of the work done by their Secretary, Mr. B. F. H. B. Tyabji, I.C.S., during the year.

Notices of good work
done by Secretary.

M. S. A. BAIG,
Secretary, Punjab and N.-W. F. P.
Joint Public Service Commission.

APPENDIX "A".

<i>Name of post.</i>	<i>Number of posts.</i>
1. Punjab Service of Engineers, Class II (I. B.) ..	5
2. Temporary Engineers, Public Works Department, (I. B.) Punjab.	23
3. Wool Expert in the Punjab Industries Department	1
4. Assistant Physiologist at the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur, in the Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II.	1
5. Assistant Demonstrator in the King Edward Medical College, Lahore.	1
6. Consulting Architect to Government, Punjab ..	1
7. Sub-Divisional Officer, Boring, in the Punjab Agri- cultural Department.	1
8. Lecturer (Women) in English at the Lahore College for Women in the P. E. S., Class II (Womens' Branch).	1
9. Assistant Professor of Mechanical Engineering in the MacLagan Engineering College, Moghalpura.	1
10. District Medical Officer of Health, Punjab ..	2
11. Temporary Engineer in the Punjab P. W. D. (I. B.)	4
12. Assistant Executive Engineer in the Punjab Service of Engineers, Class I (Irrigation Branch).	1
13. Assistant Accounts Officer for the Punjab P. W. D. (Electricity Branch).	1
14. Extra Assistant Director of Agriculture in the Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II.	1
15. Assistant Master, Lawrence School, Ghoragali ..	1
16. Jail Superintendent, Punjab ..	1
17. Mechanical and Electrical Subordinate for the Punjab P. W. D. (I. B.).	1
18. Shift Engineers in the Punjab Hydro Electric Department.	3
19. Lecturer in Fruit and Vegetable Preservation at the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.	1
20. Chemist in the Pharmacology and Therapeutics Department of the King Edward Medical College Lahore.	1

<i>Name of post.</i>	<i>Number of posts.</i>
21. Assistant to the Professor of Surgery at the Punjab Veterinary College, Lahore, in the Punjab Veterinary Service, Class II.	1
22. Assistant to the Professor of Animal Husbandry at the Punjab Veterinary College, Lahore, in the Punjab Veterinary Service, Class II.	1
23. Assistant to the Professor of Pathology at the Punjab Veterinary College, Lahore, in the Punjab Veterinary Service, Class II.	1
24. Principal of the Industrial Teachers Training Class for Women to be started at Lahore under the Punjab Industries Department.	1
25. Lecturer in Surveying and Drawing at the Punjab Engineering School, Rasul, in the P. S. E. Class II.	1
26. District Medical Officers of Health, Punjab ..	3
27. Deputy Superintendent of Police, N.-W. F. P. ..	1
28. Sales Engineer for the Malakand Hydro-Electric Scheme, N.-W. F. P.	1
29. Superintending Engineer for the Malakand Hydro-Electric Scheme, N.-W. F. P.	1
30. Provincial Town Planner, Punjab ..	1
31. Agricultural Bacteriologist in the Punjab Agricultural Service, Class I.	1

The posts shown at serial Nos. 1, 2, 3 and 6 were advertised by the departments concerned before the Commission came into existence, but the applications received were referred to the Commission.

2. In the case of post No. 7, the department had nominated two men who had already served in the Punjab Agricultural Department but were retrenched in 1931, and asked the Commission to advise on their suitability. As, however, the appointment was to be made by direct recruitment and not by promotion from within the service, the post was advertised by the Commission after reference to Government.

The same remarks apply to posts No. 15 and 16 except that the men nominated had not been retrenched.

Posts numbered 17, 18 and 24 were advertised by the departments themselves without knowledge of the fact that the advice of the Commission was necessary.

Post No. 31 was not advertised before the close of the year.

The Commission made recommendations in respect of the following posts, 1 to 11, 14 to 16, 18, 19, 27 and 29 which were accepted by the Provincial Governments. In regard to posts Nos. 18 and 27, orders of the Government were not received during the year. It may be added in respect of post No. 10 that the requisition was for two temporary posts—one for five years and the other for nine months. Government filled one temporary vacancy and included the second vacancy in a subsequent requisition for three District Medical Officers of Health—two permanent and one temporary.

Post No. 12.—The requisition was for a Muslim or a Sikh candidate. The Commission could not, however, find suitable candidates from these communities and recommended to Government that the maximum age limit for candidates to be raised from 25 to 30. No reply was received to this.

Post No. 13.—The post was originally advertised in October, 1937, and recommendations were made in December, 1937. Government, however, asked the Commission to re-advertise the post under somewhat different conditions. The post was accordingly advertised again, but recommendations could not be made before the close of the year.

Posts Nos. 17, 20, 21 to 23, 26, 28 and 30.—Recommendations could not be made before the close of the year.

Post No. 24.—The Commission were unable to find a suitable candidate for the post on the salary sanctioned by Government. They accordingly suggested that the grade be revised. Government agreed to this and fixed the revised scale at Rs. 200—10—300. Government's reply was received on the 25th March, 1938, and the post was re-advertised accordingly.

Post No. 25.—The recruitment for this post was to be confined to Muslims, but as none of the applicants fulfilled the conditions set forth in the Government's requisition, the Commission could not recommend them for appointment to the post and suggested to Government the advisability of amending the terms of requisition. No reply has been received.

APPENDIX "B"

BRIEF NOTES ON THE SELECTIONS HELD BY THE COMMISSION.

SELECTION OF ENGINEERS FOR THE PUNJAB, P. W. D. (IRRIGATION DEPARTMENT) JUNE, JULY AND OCTOBER, 1937.

June-July Selection.

The number of posts to be filled were—

	Permanent	Temporary.
	P. S. E. Class	
	II.	
Hindus	1	6
Muslims	3	11
Sikhs	1	5
Anglo-Indians, Christians	..	1

The Chief Engineer had advertised the posts in April, 1937, before the Commission was formed and all the applications received—255 in number—were forwarded to the Commission for preliminary examination. Seven more applications were received later through the same officer.

The qualifications required were an engineering degree or qualifications as laid down in the P. S. E., Class II, I. B. Rules, 1936 and training as a Civil Engineer. Experience in Irrigation works was to be considered an asset although not absolutely essential. The age limit for the permanent posts was between 22 and 26 (on the 1st of June, 1937). No age limit was specified for temporary engineers.

One hundred and ninety-three candidates were invited for interview which commenced on 23rd June, 1937. Only 161, however, appeared. Among the applicants were some who had been in the Irrigation Branch service previously and retrenched some years ago.

In the first week of July a letter was received from the Chief Engineer, Punjab Irrigation, specifying the age limits as :—

35 years for retrenched men,

30 years for new recruits,

for both permanent and temporary service.

Twice the number of men had to be recommended to Government against the number of posts to be filled. The Commission's recommendations were as follows :—

Community	Permanent		Temporary.	
	Vacancies.	No. recommended.	Vacancies.	No. recommended.
Hindus	1	2	6	12
Muslims	3	6	11	14
Sikhs	1	2	5	10
Christians	1	2

Owing to the paucity of Muslim candidates within the age limits it was possible to recommend for the temporary posts only 14 candidates instead of 22 and the Commission had to send up names of some candidates who had obtained comparatively low marks in the *viva voce* test.

Selection of October, 1937.

In September, 1937, another requisition was received from the Chief Engineer asking for 4 more temporary engineers of the Muslim community. The age limit was raised by Government to 37. A fresh advertisement brought 13 new applications. Seven candidates appeared for interview on the 2nd October, 1937. From these and from the old list of candidates interviewed in June and July 8 candidates were recommended to Government.

Mr. Farquharson, Chief Engineer, assisted the Commission in the selection.

Wool Expert in the Punjab Industries Department.

This post was advertised by the Director of Industries in March before the Commission came into existence. The qualifications required were a diploma or degree in textiles from a recognised institution, all-round expert knowledge of the technique of woollen industry and specialization in the process of finishing woollen cloth of all varieties on modern machines. Preference was to be given to a candidate who had practical commercial experience and had worked in woollen mills.

2. Twenty-nine applications were received and forwarded to the Commission in May, 1937. In addition one man applied from England but could not be considered. Two of the applicants were not British subjects and were, therefore, not summoned for interview. Of the remaining twenty-seven, twenty-two only were willing to accept the new terms, contained in a subsequent Government letter, withdrawing the offer of Commission on sales contained in the original advertisement. These twenty-two candidates were invited to appear for interview before the Commission on the 5th October, 1937.

The Commission recommended two candidates, of whom one was already employed in the Indian Stores Department and the other had just returned from training in England. The Director of Industries assisted the Commission at the interviews.

ASSISTANT PHYSIOLOGIST AT THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE,

AND RESEARCH INSTITUTE, LYALLPUR, IN THE PUNJAB AGRICULTURAL SERVICE, CLASS II (TEMPORARY FOR TWO YEARS).

The Commission were asked to recommend candidates for this post in June, 1937. The qualifications prescribed were the degree of M. Sc. in Botany, ability to teach Botany and experience of research in Plant Physiology. Candidates were to be not less

than 22 years of age. Government servants were eligible. Other qualifications being equal, preference was to be given to members of Punjab Notified Agricultural Tribes.

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement ten applications were received—four from the Punjab (all of notified agricultural tribes), one from Ka-hmir, one from the U. P., one from Bombay and one from Baroda State. All the candidates were summoned for interview as they possessed the necessary academic qualifications and all appeared. The standard of the candidates was high. They, however, lacked experience of research and qualifications in applied botany. Candidates from outside the Punjab had practically no knowledge of Punjab crops and seasonal conditions. The candidate recommended by the Commission was already employed as Research Assistant in the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.

3. The Director of Agriculture, Punjab, assisted the Commission at the interview.

Assistant Demonstrator for the Pathology Department of the King Edward Medical College, Lahore.

Recruitment to this post which was for a period of 5 years and was confined to Sikhs only was referred by the Punjab Government to the Commission in August, 1937. Only medical graduates of the Punjab University who had qualified from the King Edward Medical College, Lahore, within the previous five years were eligible; and other things being equal, preference was to be given to zamindars and those who had held the appointment of House-Surgeon, House Physician or Casualty Medical officer in the Mayo Hospital, Lahore. The maximum age limit was 35 years.

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement six applications were received. All the candidates were technically qualified. One candidate, however, belonged to the Kashmir State and was not therefore called for interview. All the five candidates appeared for interview. The general quality of candidates was only average and most of them lacked general knowledge. The candidate recommended by the Commission for appointment was a non-zamindar as his qualifications were best.

3. The Inspector-General of Civil Hospitals, Punjab, assisted the Commission at the interviews.

Consulting Architect to Government, Punjab.

This post was advertised simultaneously in India and in England by the Chief Engineer, Punjab P. W. D., B. & R. Branch, before the Commission came into existence. The qualifications required were Associate membership or Fellowship of the Royal Institute of British Architects and at least five years' practical experience of

architectural work, preferably in India. Preference was to be given to applicants who were also Associate Members of the Town Planning Institute. Candidates were preferably to be not less than 30 and not more than 40 years.

2. The advertisement in India elicited nine applications. Three of the candidates did not possess the minimum qualifications prescribed. Among these latter was the sole applicant from the Punjab. The Commission summoned 7 candidates for interview. The Commission considered two candidates suitable and recommended their names to Government for appointment to the post. Mr. B. M. Sullivan, C.I.E., O. B. E., Superintending Architect, Architectural Division, assisted the Commission at the interviews.

3. In England the Selection Committee which consisted of three members including Mr. Macfarlane, late Chief Engineer, P. W. D., Punjab, interviewed 5 candidates and recommended three of these. None of them, however, possessed 'Town-planning' experience. The Commission endorsed the recommendations made by the High Commissioner and submitted them to Government together with the recommendations based on their own interview.

4. The lack of response from the Punjab was disappointing and suggested lack of interest and lack of local facilities for training.

Sub-Divisional Officer, Boring, in the Punjab Agricultural Department (Special Post).

The Commission were asked to recommend candidates for this post in August, 1937. The qualifications required were a qualification in Civil Engineering from a recognised institution or University (foreign or Indian) and practical experience of well-boring, lift irrigation and internal combustion engines. Those with experience of electric motors and pumps were to be preferred. Further, other qualifications being equal, preference was to be given to members of notified agricultural tribes. The minimum age-limit was 22 years.

2. Thirty-five persons applied. Three did not possess the prescribed minimum academic qualifications; and the Commission summoned the remaining thirty-two candidates for interview. Thirty-one candidates appeared. More than half the number of candidates were unsuitable as they lacked the required practical experience. The candidate recommended by the Commission was a retrenched officer of the Punjab Agricultural Department.

Woman Lecturer in English at the Lahore College for Women in the Punjab Educational Service, Class II.

The Commission were asked to make recruitment to this post in July, 1937. The qualifications required were an Honours degree in English of a good foreign University, a post-graduate course of train-

ing in teaching and a certificate and a good knowledge of one of the vernaculars of the Punjab. Only women were eligible and the age limit was 35 years. Preference was to be given to a candidate belonging to an agriculturist family.

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement five applications were received, but only two of the applicants were sufficiently qualified. Both the candidates were considered suitable and recommended to Government for appointment. No qualified Punjab candidates applied. Miss Thomas, Deputy Directress of Public Instruction, assisted the Commission at the interview.

Extra Assistant Director of Agriculture in the Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II.

In October, 1937, the Punjab Government asked the Commission to recommend one or more persons for appointment to a permanent vacancy of Extra Assistant Director of Agriculture in the Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II. The qualifications required of candidates were a degree of B. Sc. in Agriculture from an Indian or foreign University followed by post-graduate study or research in Agriculture and the allied sciences. Experience of agronomical research and of the various operations which the District staff of the Agricultural Department carries out were additional qualifications. The minimum age limit was 22 years, and other qualifications being equal preference was to be given to Members of Punjab Notified Agricultural tribes. Members of the Punjab Agricultural Department were eligible provided they were not above 35 years of age.

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement 12 applications were received, of which 9 were from persons already in Government service. The Commission summoned 10 candidates for interview, omitting 2 who lacked the requisite post-graduate study and experience. Only 9 candidates appeared for interview.

The quality of candidates was good. Several candidates were highly qualified and experienced and possessed foreign degrees. The Commission recommended for appointment two men who were already in the Punjab Government Agricultural Department.

3. The qualifications prescribed by Government and the fact that Government servants were eligible confined the selection in practice to men already in the Punjab Agricultural Department.

Assistant Master in the Lawrence School, Ghora Gali.

This was a temporary leave vacancy for about 9 months and was open only to unmarried Europeans and Anglo-Indians. Candidates were required to have passed the Intermediate examination of a recognised University with training in a European school. They were also to possess experience of handling European boys and to be not less than 30 years of age. Preference was to be given to persons who had past experience in the Lawrence School, Ghora Gali, and were familiar with the conditions prevailing there.

2. The advertisement elicited 6 applications and as all the candidates were academically qualified, all were summoned for interview.

3. The requisition was for a teacher with experience and only two candidates possessed this experience—one had had it at Ghora Gali and the other at Mussoorie. Both were recommended by the Commission for appointment. The Rev. W. F. Cotton, Principal of the Lawrence College, Ghora Gali, assisted the Commission at the interview of candidates.

Superintendent of Jail in the Punjab Jails Department.

On the 29th September, 1937, the Home Secretary to Government, Punjab, asked the Commission to consider the suitability of an *ex*-Military Officer for appointment as a Superintendent of Jails in the Punjab Jails Department. The filing of the appointment was in accordance with the recommendations of the Staffing Jails Committee that certain posts in the Jails Department should be filled by retired military officers. The Commission considered, however, that as Government proposed to make an initial appointment, the most suitable course would be for them to forward requisition of their requirements to the Commission, and leave it to them to suggest suitable candidates for the appointment. Government was addressed accordingly, on the 20th October, 1937. On the 4th December, 1937, a requisition was received from Government stating that a commissioned officer (preferably a European officer of the Indian Army) was required, with not less than 10 years service and between 30 and 40 years of age. On this the Commission took the following action:—

- (a) Advertised the post in India.
- (b) Addressed the Military Secretary, Army Headquarters, with a request for a list of qualified officers willing to accept the appointment;
- (c) Requested the High Commissioner for India, London, to advertise the post in England, and to obtain from the War Office a list of qualified officers willing to accept the appointment; and
- (d) Fixed the 28th February, 1938, as the last date on which applications for the post would be received by the Commission.

2. Forty-one applications for the post were received and 9 candidates were summoned for interview, None of the applicants from England were summoned as their qualifications were no better than those of applicants in India. Of the nine candidates summoned seven appeared.

The Commission recommended one European and one Indian applicant for appointment. The former had had past experience of command of labour in a Pioneer Regiment of the Indian Army

and of administration as a Cantonment Executive Officer and was moreover, a linguist of considerable attainments in Urdu and Punjabi. The Inspector-General of Prisons assisted the Commission at the interview.

3. The Commission noticed that this appointment met with considerable criticism in the Punjab Legislative Assembly because the advertisement stated that European officers of the Indian Army would be preferred. This preference was announced in the advertisement in conformity with the usual practice of the Commission, whenever, preference is to be given to any particular class or community, so that all candidates may know exactly how they stand in this respect.

Three Shift Engineers in the Punjab P.W.D., Electricity Branch.

On the 17th March, 1938, an advertisement by the Chief Engineer, Punjab, Public Works Department, Electricity Branch, appeared in the *Civil and Military Gazette*, asking candidates to apply in person for the posts of three Shift Engineers in the scale of Rs. 150—25—200. The qualifications required were a first class certificate under the Punjab Boilers Act and experience with steam turbines, Bellis engines and water tube boilers. As the appointment to these posts could only be made on the advice of the Commission in accordance with section 266 of the Government of India Act 1935, read with regulation 5 (a) of the Punjab and N.-W. F. P. Joint Public Service Commission (Limitation of Functions) Regulations, the Chief Engineer was informed of the irregularity.

2. The Chief Engineer explained to the Commission that a steam power station had to be taken over immediately, that he required engineers with certificates under the Punjab Boilers Act and that the delay which would result in the appointment of Shift Engineers if the matter were referred to the Commission in the usual manner would seriously impede the work to be done. In view of the urgency, the Commission agreed to interview his candidates immediately.

3. Nine candidates appeared for interview by the Commission on the 18th March, 1938. The Chief Engineer assisted the Commission at the interviews.

4. Three of the applicants were qualified for appointment, and were recommended by the Commission.

Lecturer in Fruit and Vegetable Preservation at the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur, in the Subordinate Agricultural Service.

The post was a temporary one and was advertised by the Director of Agriculture, Punjab. In all seven applications were received which were referred to the Commission.

2. The qualifications required were a high degree in Chemistry of a recognised Indian or Foreign University and at least 2 years' research or teaching experience in Fruit and Vegetable Preservation.

Preference was to be given to those who had practical experience and knowledge of fruit culture and were domiciled in the Punjab. There was no age restriction.

3. Of the seven applicants, one belonged to an Indian State the subjects of which had not been declared to be eligible for Government service in the Punjab, and another applied late. Therefore, five candidates were called for interview. One did not attend. The candidate recommended for appointment was suitable but not outstanding.

Temporary post (for five years) of Superintending Engineer for the N.-W.F.P. Hydro-Electric Department.

The requisition for this post was received on the 22nd December, 1937. The qualifications required were M. I. C. E. and M. I. E. E. or equivalent, with sound training in electrical engineering and experience of preparing and constructing hydro-electric projects, operation of large electrical schemes, developing electricity, administration and finance markets. The age limits were 40—50 years.

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement 12 applications were received. It was decided to summon 7 candidates. The rest were outside the age limits. Six candidates appeared, the seventh having left the country.

3. The Commission forwarded the names of two candidates and definitely recommended one of these.

4. Mr. Oram, Superintending Engineer, P.W.D., N.-W.F.P., and Mr. Thomas, Chief Engineer, Hydro-Electric Department, Punjab, assisted the Commission at the interview.

Assistant Professor of Mechanical Engineering in the Maclagan Engineering College, Moghalpura.

1. This post was advertised by the Commission in September, 1937. Applications were invited from Muslims only, preferably with Punjab or Delhi domicile. The qualifications required were a degree of B. Sc. in Engineering or M. & E. E. (Roorkee) or A. C. G. I. (London) gained after a full time course of college study with two years in workshops or on works and three years' teaching experience in an Engineering Institution or A. M. I. M. E. with five years workshop experience and three years' teaching experience in an engineering institution, evidence of capability to lecture and impart laboratory instruction up to the standard of Honours B. Sc. Engineering degree of the University of London. Candidates were to be not less than 30 and not more than 45 years of age.

2. Five applications were received in response to the advertisement by the Commission. All these candidates together with the two who had previously applied to the Principal of the College in

response to a previous advertisement by him were invited to appear before the Commission. Of the total number invited, two did not appear and of the remainder one was found not to possess the minimum academic qualifications required. The candidate recommended by the Commission was already in the College staff.

3. The response to the advertisement was poor. This was probably due to the highly specialised qualifications demanded, to the heavy recruitment of engineers that had been made for the Irrigation Branch in July, 1937, and to the restriction of applicants to members of one community only.

4. Mr. Bence Jones, Principal, MacLagan Engineering College Moghalpura, assisted the Commission at the interviews.

District Medical Officers of Health for the Public Health Department (two temporary posts).

In August, 1937, the Punjab Government asked the Commission to hold a selection for appointment to a temporary additional post of District Medical Officer of Health in the Public Health Department, in a five years vacancy. The qualifications required of candidates were a degree in Medicine and Surgery with a qualification in Public Health of a recognised University or institution. The maximum age limit was 35 years, and preference was to be given to Muslims and Agriculturists.

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement, six applications were received. All the candidates were academically qualified, but five of them were overage. In view of the paucity of candidates, the Commission decided to call for interview all candidates except two who were overage by more than five years.

3. Before the interview was held, another requisition was received by the Commission from the Punjab Government for recruitment to a temporary post of District Medical Officer of Health. The terms of the requisition were identical to those of the previous one, except that this vacancy was for a period of nine months only. The Commission decided to bring this to the notice of candidates appearing at the interview in case they wished to be considered also for this temporary vacancy.

4. The Commission recommended three candidates for appointment to the two vacancies. The Director of Public Health, Punjab assisted the Commission at the interview.

5. The Commission noticed that the candidates for the post of District Medical Officer of Health had had no experience of rural sanitation problems and rural uplift schemes in the Punjab. They therefore, suggested to Government, that the candidates appointed should be given training in these subjects for a couple of weeks before they were posted as District Medical Officers of Health in the District. The Punjab Government accepted the suggestion.

Deputy Superintendent of Police in the North-West Frontier Province.

The requisition for this post was received by the Commission the last week of October, 1937. The qualifications required were degree of B. A. of the Punjab, Delhi or Aligarh Muslim University, with ability to speak and read Urdu fluently and to write Persian characters with facility. The age limits were 21—25 years. Candidates were required to possess the N.-W. F. P. domicile and a minimum height of 5'—7" and a normal chest measurement of 33" with its expansion of 1½".

2. In response to the Commission's advertisement 50 applications were received. The Commission summoned for interview those candidates, 35 in all, who appeared to possess the qualifications required but actually only 32 candidates appeared. The quality of candidates varied considerably and some were clearly unsuitable for the appointment. These were mostly townsmen. Some, however, were distinctly good; and the Commission had no difficulty in making their recommendations. The general standard, particularly in General Knowledge, was disappointing.

APPENDIX C.

Recruitment by selection to Punjab and North-West Frontier Province Services.

Serial No.	Name of the post or service.	Class to which the post or service belongs.	Number of vacancies offered.	Community.	Number of applications received	Number of applicants qualified.	Number of persons called for interview.	Number of persons recommended.	Whether the candidate recommended by the Commission was accepted by the Government or not.	If not, reasons for the same.	REMARKS.
1	Assistant Engineer..	Punjab Service of Engineers, Class II.	3	Muslims ..	61	39	39	6	Accepted	..	
			1	Hindus ..	137	118	118	2			
			1	Sikhs ..	51	29	29	2			
			..	Christians ..	11	5	5	..			
			..	Others ..	1	1	1	..			
2	Temporary Engineer, for the Punjab Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.	..	11	Muslims ..	61	38	38	14	Accepted	...	
			6	Hindus ..	137	116	116	12			
			5	Sikhs ..	51	33	33	10			
			1	Christian ..	11	5	5	2			
			..	Others ..	1	1	1	..			

3	Wool Expert	Special post	1	Muslims	3	3	3	1	Accepted.	
				Hindus	19	16	16	1		
				Sikhs	1		
				(Christians	6	3	3	..		
4	Assistant Physiologist in the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.	Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II.	1	Muslims	4	4	4	..	Accepted.	
				Hindus	3	3	3	..		
				Sikhs	1	1	1	1		
				Christian		
5	Assistant Demonstrator in the King Edward Medical College, Lahore.	Subordinate Service.	1	Sikhs	6	5	5	1	Accepted.	
				Muslims	1	1	1	..		
				Hindus	2	2	2	1		
				Others	2	2	2	..		
6	Consulting Architect to Government, Punjab.	Punjab General Service.	1	Sikhs	Accepted.	
				Christians	..	9	5	..		2
				Others	..	4	4	4		1
				Muslims	..	8	7	7		1
7	Sub-Divisional Officer, Boring.	...	I	Hindus	..	17	16	16	Accepted.	
				Sikhs	..	10	9	9		..
				Muslims	..	8	7	7		1

The five Christian candidates had been interviewed in England by a Selection Committee appointed by the High Commissioner for India and the Commission concurred in his recommendations.

APPENDIX C—CONTINUED.

Serial No.	Name of the post or service.	Class to which the post or service belongs.	Number of vacancies offered.	Community.	Number of applications received.	Number of applicants qualified.	Number of persons called for interview.	Number of persons recommended.	Whether the candidate recommended by the Commission was accepted by the Government or not.	If not, reasons for the same.	REMARKS.												
8	Woman Lecturer in Lahore College for Women.	Punjab Educational Service, Class II.	1	<table border="0"> <tr> <td>Hindus</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Christians</td> <td>4</td> </tr> </table>	Hindus	1	Christians	4	1	1	1	1	Accepted.	..									
Hindus	1																						
Christians	4																						
9	Assistant Professor of Mechanical Engineering in the MacLagan Engineering College, Muzhalpura.	Punjab General Service.	1	Muslims	7	7	7	1	Accepted.	..													
10	District Medical Officer of Health.	Punjab Public Health Service.	2	<table border="0"> <tr> <td>Muslims</td> <td>..</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hindus</td> <td>..</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Sikh</td> <td>..</td> <td>..</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Christian</td> <td>..</td> <td>..</td> </tr> </table>	Muslims	..	3	Hindus	..	3	Sikh	Christian	3	2	2	2	Accepted only for one post (5 years) the other post to be re-advertised.	..	
Muslims	..	3																					
Hindus	..	3																					
Sikh																					
Christian																					
11	Temporary Engineers for the Punjab Public Works Department, Irrigation Branch.	..	4	Muslims	18	11	11	8	Accepted.	..													

12	Assistant Executive Engineers.	Punjab Service of Engineers, Class I, Irrigation Branch.	1	Muslims .. 8	3	3	..	}	-	-	None of the candidates invited for interview was found suitable for the post.
				Sikhs .. 2				
13	Assistant Accounts Officer for Punjab P.W.D., Electricity Branch.	Special post ..	1	Muslims .. 3	1	1	..	}	No.	}	Government ordered that the post should be re-advertised with reduced scale of pay and under somewhat revised conditions.
				Hindus .. 7	1	1	..				
				Sikhs .. 2				
				Parsees .. 1	1	1	1				
14	Extra Assistant Director of Agriculture.	Punjab Agricultural Service, Class II.	1	Muslims .. 5	5	5	1	}	Accepted
				Hindus .. 4	2	2	..				
				Sikhs .. 4	3	3	..				
15	Assistant Master, Lawrence School, Ghoragali.	Subordinate Educational Service.	1	Christians .. 6	6	6	2	}	Accepted
				Muslims .. 2	1	1	1				
16	Jail Superintendent, Punjab.	..	1	Hindus .. 4	2	2	..	}	Accepted
				Sikhs .. 1				
				Christians .. 3	6	6	1				
				Muslims .. 9	6	6	..				
17	Mechanical and Electrical Subordinate in the Punjab P. W. D., Irrigation Branch.	Subordinate Service.	1	Hindus .. 27	18	18	2	}	..	}	..
				Sikhs .. 6	4	4	..				
				Christian .. 1				

APPENDIX C—CONCLUDED.

Serial No.	Name of the post or service.	Class to which the post or service belongs.	Number of vacancies offered.	Community.	Number of applications received.	Number of applicants qualified.	Number of persons called for interview.	Number of persons recommended.	Whether the candidate recommended by the Commission was accepted by the Government or not.	If not, reasons for the same.	REMARKS.
18	Shift Engineers in the Public Works Department, Electricity Branch.	Subordinate ...	3	Muslims ... Hindus ... Sikhs ...	1 5 3	1 5 3	1 5 3	.. 2 1			
19	Lecturer in Fruit and Vegetable Preservation in the Punjab Agricultural College, Lyallpur.	Subordinate Agricultural Service.	1	Muslims ... Hindus ...	2 5	2 3	2 3	.. 1	Accepted.		
20	Lecturer in Surveying and Drawing for the Engineering School, Rasul.	Punjab Service Of Engineers, Buildings and Roads Branch.	1	Muslims ...	5	Two were over-age. The remaining three possessed the academic qualifications but did not have the requisite experience. None was recommended by the Commission. Government was asked to amend the terms of service.

21	Deputy Superintendent of Police in the North-West Frontier Province.	Provincial Service.	1 {	Muslims	...	29	21	21	1	
				Hindus	...	16	13	13	..	
				Sikhs	...	4	1	1	..	
				Christian	...	1	
22	Superintending Engineer for the Malakand Hydro-Electric Scheme, North-West Frontier Province.	Provincial Service.	1 {	Muslim		
				Hindus	..	3	2	2	..	
				Christians	..	8	3	3	1	
				Parsees	..	1	1	1	1	Accepted.

APPENDIX D.
Examinations.

Serial No.	Name of the Examination.	Month in which the examination was held.	Number of vacancies offered.	Community.	NUMBER OF CANDIDATES WHO					Percentage of passed to examined.	Number and names of centres at which the examination was held.	Any special feature of the examination.	REMARKS.
					Applied for admission to the examination.	Were admitted at the examination.	Appeared at the examination.	Qualified at the examination.	Were actually appointed by the Government.				
I	Punjab Civil Service (executive Branch).	October, 1937	4	Hindus ...	98	98	86	72	1	83.7	} 75.46 % Lahore.	..	One candidate was found cheating in the examination hall and was consequently disqualified.
				Muslims ..	61	61	53	37	3	69.8			
				Sikhs ..	23	23	23	14	..	60.9			
				Christians ...	1	1	1			
				Total ...	183	183	163	123	4				

APPENDIX ' E. ' १

Review of the Punjab Civil Service (Executive Branch) Examination by the Commission.

To be of any value, reports on examinations should have the merit of usefulness. It is important that future candidates should learn from the mistakes and shortcomings of those who have gone before. One of the main functions of such reports, therefore, should be to emphasize and lay stress on those features the correction of which is likely to be of most value to candidates appearing for competitive examinations. An attempt has, therefore, been made here to bring out those features which are likely to prove most useful to aspirants to Government service by competition.

2. The candidates' knowledge of English left much to be desired. In the English paper the main feature of the scripts appeared to be a terrible uniformity of mediocrity. The incorrect use of English words and idioms was lamentable. One candidate, asked to discourse on the theme "My favourite Poet and why"—a subject selected by the majority of candidates—commenced "In 'The Ancient Mariner,' we have a nice ballad. Its description is simply marvellous." But perhaps the most pathetic remark culled from these observations on English poet was, "John Keats stands glaring in the galaxy (*sic*) of poets." The majority of answers in the essay "Travellers and Travelling" displayed an astonishing ignorance of the names of any modern travellers or of places visited. There was an abundance of spelling mistakes which were not confined solely to English, but were general throughout all the scripts.

3. This slovenliness in composition and spelling also extended to the vernaculars and classical languages. Translations from one language into another were too literal which detracted from their value. In particular, the translations from English into Persian were far from satisfactory and the efforts at composition were likewise poor. The Sanskrit scripts evinced a poor knowledge of grammar. Another objectionable feature of the vernacular papers was the use made by candidates of foreign words. In Hindi, for example, too much use was made of Persian and Arabic words, while the use of vernacularised English words betrayed an ignorance of modern Hindi words. Candidates should avoid introducing foreign words when Hindi words are available. Not only does it lose them marks: it also shows lack of good taste. In the Urdu papers reed pens were not used by some candidates although this script is best written with such pens.

4. Such subjects as History, Economics, Philosophy and Political Science demand a well developed critical faculty which on the whole was lacking in the majority of candidates. Some candidates, however, did show powers of independent thinking and an ability to criticise and offer constructive suggestions. This was particularly so in the answers to questions 2, 7 and 10 of the paper "History of British Administration in India." But one common mistake in all scripts was that candidates do not appreciate the value of brevity

and precision. Too much stress is usually devoted to the introduction of the topic instead of approaching it directly, with the result that candidates do not distribute their time proportionately in answering the question. This is a common fault of candidates in examinations the world over.

5. In Science the general standard was moderate. In such subjects as Chemistry and Physics, more attention should be paid to numerical questions and systematic and tabulated answers and relevant diagrams.

6. No candidates offered Latin or Agriculture in the examination. The fact that Agriculture was not taken is deplorable in view of the present day stress laid on the importance of this subject.

7. On the whole the standard of the papers was moderate, the best scripts being those of Law, Philosophy and Political Science, and the poorest those of Physics. Most of the candidates who offered Physics did not appear to possess very clear ideas of the Physical phenomena involved. They lacked the ability to express themselves in lucid language.

8. The attention of all candidates is drawn to the instructions prepared for their benefit, neglect to follow which creates an unfavourable impression in the minds of examiners. In most papers the number of questions to be answered is limited. Candidates should, therefore, attempt only the prescribed number. Any question attempted beyond this limit is sheer waste of time and effort.

9. In the *viva voce*, candidates varied enormously, but on the whole the quantity was good. There were some outstanding candidates. On the other hand the general outlook and personal qualities of some were such as to render inexplicable the reason which prompted them to sit for the examination. Many candidates showed a pitiful ignorance of the history and geography of their own Province. There was a lack of interest in general subjects outside the academic sphere. Candidates should pay more attention to a study of the leading newspapers and acquaint themselves with what is going on in the world.

10. Candidates might with advantage consult their tutors before sitting for such an examination as this, so that only those may appear who have reached the high standard required and possess the necessary physical and mental qualities. It is a waste of time and money for any but the best to compete in it.

11. Some of the answers given during the *viva voce* test are reproduced in Appendix 'F.' They are quoted as showing a lack of interest in everyday matters which is remarkable in educated men.

APPENDIX " F ".

1. Where is Utopia ? It is a country in Africa.
2. Name the Governor of the Punjab ? Lord Emerson.
3. After whom is the Albert Victor Hospital, Lahore, named ? After Prince Victor who is the son of the Duke of Windsor.
4. After whom is the Queen Mary College, Lahore, named ? After some Queen of England, who built it in the 14th Century.
5. Into what three main classes may the plays of Shakespeare be divided ? Tragedy, Comedy and Farce, the last-named being midway between tragedy and comedy.
6. What is meant by black-balling ? (a) A term in cricket. (b) This is something connected with the Ethiopians.
7. What is meant by experiment ? It is the mother of science.
8. What did Mr. Nair do in connection with air ? He was an airman killed when doublecrossing the Atlantic.
9. Who was Sir Douglas Haig ? He was the President of the Haig Conference.
10. Where is Mahinjo Daro ? It is a town situated near Rawalpindi.
11. Who is a P. A. ? P. A. means permanent associate.
12. Do you know anything about Mussolini ? He is the Emperor of Ethiopia.
13. Where is Fazilka ? A town in the Montgomery District.
14. What do you understand by the Science of Horticulture ? A science which deals with animals.
15. What is the pay of the Governor of the Punjab ? (a) Rs. 20,000 per month. (b) Rs. 64,000 per annum.
16. What is Fort Munro ? A town in United States of America.
17. Are you interested in Agriculture ? When is cotton sown ? Yes, I am interested in agriculture. Cotton is sown in September or October and harvested in March.
18. When a man is vaccinated, what is the name of the thing that is injected into his arm ? The urine of the cow.
19. What is Big Ben in London ? A corporation in England controlling Broadcasting.

20. What is the policy of the opposition of the Unionist Party? To overpower the Unionists.
21. Where did you play in your foot ball team? Straight forward.
22. What is polyandry? A science which has something to do with plants.
23. Where is Malwa situated? In the U. P.
24. What do you understand by Red Tape? It means socialism.
25. What is a numerator in arithmetic? An instrument which takes down numbers.
26. Who is Sir Sikander Hyat Khan? He belongs to one of the agricultural tribes near Sheikhpura.
27. What are liquid assets of a Company? Substances which turn blue litmus red.
28. Where do you meet Zamindars in Lahore? In the zoo and the museum.
29. What is your hobby? Hanking after Government service.
30. Do you know the difference in height between a shisham plant and a wheat plant? I am a townsman and not a villager.
31. What do you understand when I say my box has been rifled? It means my rifle has been loaded with cartridges.
32. What is a planet? Something that has a tail behind it. What is a star? It has no tail behind it.
33. What is meant by 'Power of Attorney'? Power given by Government to the Attorney General.
34. What is meant by a case heard *ex parte*? It means a case heard in secrecy.
35. Who rules in China? Two Lamas.
36. What is P. O. P.? A kind of solution.
37. What is meant by a man having blue blood? It means that he is unfaithful.
38. What is a horoscope? An instrument with which you can see far off things.
39. What happened to Ladysmith in South Africa? She was the wife of Capt. Smith. I do not know what happened to her.

40. Who are black shirts? Parts of a Corpse in Germany
41. What is meant by V. P. P.? It means "Reply, if you please".
42. Who was Lord Kitchener? He was the Viceroy of India.
43. What is the key of the Mediterranean? Aden.
44. Can you give an example of customary law? Propriety is not inherited by widows among the Hindus.
45. Who is the Governor of the Punjab? Sir Herbert Emerson. Who is his Chief Secretary? Ahmad Yar Khan Daultana.
46. What is meant by exploitation? Cheating a man in a civilized manner.
47. What is meant by pouring oil on troubled waters? It means adding to one's troubles, *i.e.*, fuel to fire.
48. Telegraphic charges for 11 words in India are eight annas and for 15 words twelve annas.
49. Plaintiff means defendant. There is no difference between a client and a plaintiff.
50. The name of the Englishman who has ever been President of the Indian National Congress is C. F. Andrews.
51. The direct route from Lahore to Simla is via Saharanpur. There is a small line which connects Kalka with Saharanpur.
52. Bukhara is to the north-east of Lahore.
53. Iraq is in South Africa.
54. Malta is a naval base somewhere in Asia Minor.
55. The Prime Minister of the U. P. is Ballabhai Pant.
56. List of Honours in War is the list of those who are successful in war.
57. Salvation Army is an army of *ex*-soldiers.
58. Scapegoat is a person who makes sacrifice to gain his ends.
59. Prime Minister of Bengal is Sir Fazl-i-Hussain.
60. Uncle Sam is a nickname for a noble man.
61. By left wingers we mean a silent party.
62. Scap egoat means a black leg.

63. Territorial army is an army that is recruited from a territory.
64. Alma Mater is the name of a University in Oxford.
65. Rolling Stock are those carriages which are set apart to serve as reserve.
66. Poor classes in Southern India drink Methylated spirit in place of costly liquors.
67. A chowkidar is one who informs the villagers about thieves, when they (the thieves) are about to commit theft.
68. Polo is played in plus fours.
69. A "cattle pound" is one where cattle take water.
70. A cattle lifter is so called because he lifts doors in order to steal cattle.
71. Monogamy means having one husband only. Polygamy means having more than one husband.



